City Research Online

City, University of London Institutional Repository

This is the accepted version of the paper.

This version of the publication may differ from the final published version.

Writing Exile: Displacement and Arrival in Eva Hoffman's *Lost in Translation* and Edward Said's *Out of Place*

Sarah Jilani
University of Oxford

Abstract: Both Eva Hoffman's *Lost in Translation* (1998) and Edward Said's *Out of Place* (1999) are memoirs that recount a life of constant adjustments and re-orientations of the self, where the anchoring concept of 'home 'cannot denote a centre upon which their multiple displacements can be tethered. There is no attempt here to imply both of these memoirs can seamlessly be read together in every sense, simply because both are émigré intellectuals; however, their shared trajectory of departures and arrivals crucially foregrounds space in their negotiation of the exilic experience. For both writers, inner dépaysement gives rise to a simultaneous coming to terms with the tensions of belonging that are already apparent within that origin so longed for. To compensate, Hoffman and Said designate language a power of emplacement, in that their shared refuge in it (both linguistic and musical) turns their displaced selves into articulated, and thus inhabited, ones. In configuring the different 'belongings 'their selves undertake, the displacements and arrivals in *Lost in Translation* and *Out of Place* advocate a space for autobiography where plural identity is recognised as ontologically cohesive.

Keywords: displacement; memoir; Eva Hoffman; Edward Said

'This distended, uncrossable, otherworldly distance I had created had been the immeasurable length of loss and longing: a distance of the imagination', (241) writes Eva Hoffman in her autobiography, *Lost in Translation*, in what is one of many nuanced retrospective moments of this emotive work. She has here come to look back on the sense of displacement that her emigration from Poland has fostered as a profoundly internalised aspect of her identity. Yet she also recognises that it was as much a distance of the heart and mind as distance from familiar social and cultural surroundings. It was a distance lived and negotiated through the imagined spaces emptied of her presence, and the new spaces within which a self-emplacement, and a scene of expression, needed definition. Inner spaces and geographies are central to Hoffman's experience of exile: they often oppose the normative complementarity of being 'in place 'and being 'at home'. Furthermore, displacement from or to them generates a multitude of positions both emancipatory and crippling in their demand that she 'learn to live with a double vision '(Out of Place 132).

This is highly complex and shifting ground to found an autobiographical scene from which to speak, and it is one that another exile memoir, published a decade later, chooses as its own: Edward Said's *Out of Place* (1999). Said's memoir traces his childhood in Jerusalem, Lebanon and Cairo, then on to the campuses of American prep schools and universities, where his sense of dislocation is a constant companion: a Christian in a Muslim world, the 'delinquent Arab 'to the fading colonial authoritarianism of an English college, a Palestinian presenting his U.S. passport at checkpoints for ease of passage. Both Hoffman's and Said's memoirs recount a life of constant adjustments and re-orientations of the self, where the anchoring concept of 'home 'cannot denote a centre against which

their multiple displacements can be tethered. There is no attempt here to imply both of these memoirs can seamlessly be read together in every sense, simply because both are émigré intellectuals. However, their shared trajectory of departures and arrivals promises rich readings into the foremost preoccupation of both autobiographies: the search for a stable identity-position from which to speak. Their written lives contain many 'arrivals'; the place of autobiography is unmade and made anew to accommodate the multiple subject positions Hoffman and Said adopt throughout their lives. Hence, as hopes of a spatial—and later, as we shall see, even linguistic—anchoring becomes increasingly fleeting, ambiguous or inauthentic to the subjects 'lived experience, they find the act of writing enacts a kind of self-emplacement, one able to shoulder such uncertainties of belonging.

To come to this intriguing trajectory of 'arrival 'as Hoffman and Said do, it becomes imperative to read these two texts first through spatiality, in its internal and external senses, and through which both writers first attempt to identify rootedness. In her book The Politics of Home, Rosemary George describes the loss of geographical specificity that the concept of 'home 'undergoes, as exile calls for a reconfiguration of its dependence on place:

> Immigration and the fictions it engenders teach a certain detachment about 'home'...Home in the immigrant genre is a fiction that one can move beyond or recreate at will. The association between an adequate self and a place to call home is held up to scrutiny and then let go. (200)

Hoffman and Said describe exile as that which not only displaces geographically, but something that generates an inner dépaysement: a de-landscaping of their subjecthood, of the places that carry certain moments or selves in their lives. Through this, the previously unproblematic, whole 'at-home-ness 'is itself re-spatialised in their memoirs. Recreated at will through the stasis of nostalgia and through the lens of childhood, its dependable and even temporally-arrested state is 'held up to scrutiny and let go'. Thus for both writers, inner dépaysement gives rise to a simultaneous coming to terms with the tensions of belonging that are already apparent within the origin so longed for: for instance, 'to open [himself] to the deeply disorganised state of [his] real history and origins, and then try to construct them in order', seems to Said as flawed a method of orienting the self as 'adopting [his] father's brashly assertive tone and saying to [himself], "I'm an American citizen, and that's it '"(Out of Place 6). For Hoffman, Krakow— seemingly the unequivocal place and inner space of 'home'—is fissured with moments of displacement as she recalls all that remains unexamined of her Jewish heritage: 'I come from the war; it is my true origin. But as with all our origins, I cannot grasp it '(Lost in Translation 23). Hoffman realises the spaces of home (land) always contained degrees of disorientation within themselves.

Faced with the fragmented nature of what she thought was a singular origin, Hoffman begins to internalise her displacement and difference in order to enact a kind of reclamation of self-representation: 'Detachment is the thing to strive for...I can overcome all this; I can almost make it go away', (Lost in Translation 137) she recalls deciding, when faced with social situations that only intensify the gulf between her internal narrative and external identity. In some contrast, Said's commitment to detachment is spurred by his overly-dogmatic father rather than the failure of nostalgia for home, but his multiculturalism, like Hoffman's recalled fragments of Jewish culture, brings about disillusionment with the search for singular origins. The musical and literary selves of Said and Hoffman respectively sees them grow possessive of their displacement: they begin to build a subjecthood committed to the exilic state. Yet what Karen Kaplan asks in her introduction to Questions of Travel: Postmodern Discourse of Displacement remains to be engaged with at this point for both writers: 'what is at stake in feeling exiled or mobile when material conditions might suggest connections and placements in specific geographies, politics, and economic practices? '(26). Displacement cannot but continue to be a key part of their attempts at self-emplacement, as that is

what is demanded of them in daily life: 'Perhaps it is in my misfittings that I fit', (Lost in Translation 164) Hoffman muses at the end of her chapter titled 'Exile', and Said, similarly, comes to believe that 'the self obscured by "Edward" could only have begun because of that rupture '(Out of Place 294). Out of this disappointment with origins, followed by their self-isolating embracing of displacement, Hoffman's and Said's markers of self- emplacement—a 'home 'beyond place, but still a space to inhabit to be sure— become self-determined spaces.

The 'second arrival 'and the poly-belonging this triggers for Hoffman and Said (moving to America in Hoffman's case; a reconnection with Palestine through his later political and academic career in Said's) enables a kind of re-orientation through writing: the tool of self-emplacement which always accompanies, and now shapes, the subject negotiating those departures or arrivals. For life writing of displacement and exile, the act of autobiography does not only become one of inscribing subjectivities, but the writing itself becomes a space of abode for these subjectivities. Hoffman and Said designate language a power of emplacement, in that their shared refuge in it (both linguistic and musical) turns their displaced selves into articulated, and thus inhabited, ones. 'The blessings and terrors of multiplicity '(Lost in Translation 164) that their subject positions entail can then work in tandem with, not in opposition to, the emplacements called-for in lived experience.

Eva Hoffman emigrates with her family from Krakow to Vancouver in 1959 at the age of 13, her parents having decided for the latter over Israel after some deliberation. Just as this memoir opens with the inner turmoil of standing on the deck of the ship as it pulls away from Gdynia, the rest of her story sustains the connection between an afloat, mobile and deeply spatialised sense of displacement corresponding to her internal shifts in subjectivity. Displacement triggers a corollary between geographies, landscapes and the constitution of the 'place- less 'subject inhabiting them, making space a crucial delineator of Hoffman's and Said's exile. The spatialisation of their displacement is established through references, musings, or simply figurative recourse to things that shape space, determining what remains within or without: sites, borders, maps, homes and schools. The terrain of their displacement becomes meticulously seen, felt and internalised, and the configuration of physical surroundings become the means through which they first try and come to terms with dispossession. Reading her early sense of displacement through the natural landscape of Canada and the social landscapes of her Vancouver community, Hoffman finds a means of remembering and articulating the particular sense of loss, alienation and decentredness marking her internal displacement.

It is a way to register the geographical and social reality of a placelessness, which is otherwise threateningly turning inward. Sarah Casteel calls for a greater attention to the Canada section of Hoffman's memoir, which is indeed essential both to establishing the connections between space and exile as well as the differing sense of displacement to her second, voluntary emigration. More striking than Hoffman's 13-year-old sullen perception of Vancouver as unwelcoming and provincial are her descriptions of the Canadian landscape, which take on an unreality concurrent with her 'un-homed 'subject position. The vocabulary of recall is one of absolute foreignness, punctuated with lacks, fissures and empty spaces: the landscape is 'vast, dull and formless...these peaks and ravines, these mountain streams and enormous boulders hurt my eyes...I can't imagine feeling that I'm part of them, that I'm in them', (Lost in Translation 100) Hoffman writes. Upon arrival, in her utter sense of displacement, Vancouver neither constitutes nor promises place at all: 'As the train approaches the station, I see what is indeed a bit of nowhere '(Lost in Translation 101). Her spatial understanding of this location is one of no-place, of vacancy. It is a space emptied of signification, of language itself; the immediate, raw loss of self- designating contours in this landscape colours her first arrival with what Casteel helpfully coins as 'negative valency '(293). The sense of space Hoffman chooses to convey (or perhaps, indeed, simply recall as such) is sparse yet heavy, colourless yet opaque: lack of place, rather than merely a foreign place.

Representations of landscape in *Lost in Translation* embody mindsets and emotions as much as they do physical geographies. The extent to which these first impressions reflect Hoffman's internal sense of displacement only becomes apparent in its full weight in relation to what came before and what comes after. The emptiness and dejection of this section is telling in its style. What is a memoir peppered with an acute ability and enjoyment in interpreting her own condition for us rarely here reaches the rigour of the previous 'Paradise 'and the later 'The New World 'chapters. The 'Exile 'chapter does contain her observations on linguistic and cultural barriers, but it is suffused with questioning, floundering, self-distancing and an ebbing of her intellectual dynamism. It could well be that 'Hoffman seems largely unable to distance herself from her teenaged perceptions ' (Casteel 291) in this section, the helpless frustration too much part and parcel of the memories she is drawing from and writing down. However, this could indeed be a conscious expression of the arresting of such faculties: 'I'm confronting a tantalising abundance that doesn't fill, and a loneliness that carves out a scoop of dizzying emptiness inside', (Lost 138) Hoffman recalls, and it is this expansiveness that dwarfs this highly articulate and self-reflexive autobiographer. Re-orientation is as of yet too nebulous a possibility in comparison to the concrete spatialisation of loss: 'I suppose this is the most palpable feeling of displacement. I have been dislocated from my centre of the world, and that world has been shifted away from my centre '(Lost 132). Emigration may have been the leaving of Poland for Canada, but displacement is a belated affect, and she only fully finds herself there upon losing the singularity of Krakow as the reference point that dictates her inner sense of space.

This subjective spatial logic is used in order to recall and record another autobiographical scene of displacement, which like Hoffman's is ridden with a surrendering of self-reflection to the vocabularies of space. Edward Said's memoir Out of Place provoked, Paul B. Armstrong identifies, a polarising set of readings by many critics with existing critical or defensive opinions of Said's body of work, suggesting the memoir is often in danger of being treated as a mere vehicle of establishing 'the authenticity of the author's subjectivity, [so as to] establish the authority of his or her argument '(98). Instead choosing to read the contradictions defining Said's history as contributing to his political, literary and cultural theorisings without exclusively privileging their effect, Armstrong urges our attention towards the particular senses of displacement in this memoir. He identifies a foregrounding of lack, much like Hoffman's geographies of 'negative valence', permeating Out of Place:

> [Said's] split self is simultaneously a resource and a cause for anguish and regret. He desires an integral, unified self, but...the perspective that this doubleness gives him on the defining categories of the authorities distances him sufficiently from their power that he can criticize and evade them. (111)

His displacement, and the fragmentation into multiple subjectivities that it can entail, functions as a means of distancing, of emptying the space that gives displacement its signifying power, in order to keep the self separate. It is a self- choosing to arrive in a 'no-place 'rather than acknowledge and internalise the decentredness of 'home'. In this way, Said's early life does not mirror Hoffman's first emigration, but instead involves one eventual emigration to the United States from a tripartite terrain of 'home 'that has configured his sense of displacement from the first. Kaplan points out that the contradictory elements to Said's critical positions demonstrate 'the complex historical, cultural and geographic points of identification '(113) he recalls having to negotiate through- out his life; in a sense, his displacement is experienced while still geographically emplaced. Said grows up with the privileges of a bourgeois lifestyle that his self- made father Wadie curiously both lavishes upon him and for which he demands a price, in the form of Said's feelings of inadequacy and guilt. The family live in Cairo, and for the young 'Edward', their regular trips to Palestine carry an association of belonging, but never a homecoming. 'It was a place I took for granted, the country I was from, where family and friends existed', (Out of Place 20) Said writes, and as they increasingly spend

more time in Cairo after 1947, he says, 'Palestine acquired a languid, almost dreamlike aspect for me... I recall thinking that being in Jerusalem was pleasant but tantalisingly open, temporary, even transitory '(Out of Place 22). Like Hoffman's experience of Vancouver in her first years, Said's predicament carries a similar sense of place emptied of the meaning they 'should 'carry for one reason or other. From 1943 the family also starts spending the summer months in the Lebanese village of Dhour el Shweir, which is similarly suspended between displacement and rootedness for Said: his mother is from Lebanon and many family friends from Beirut visit them in Dhour, yet his summer romance there exists in a bubble, and the 'austerity and general barrenness of daily life ' (Out of Place 170) never quite bestows the place a sense of permanence. He recalls how Cairo, too, could catch him off-guard with the occasional incident or feeling that reminds him of his outsider status. The Cairo of his childhood is still culturally British. The spaces his class privilege allows him to access are still laden with racial privilege, making this 'home 'fit uncomfortably. Said recalls:

> Coming home at dusk across one of the vast outlying fields of the Gezira Club, I was accosted by an Englishman..."Don't you know you're not supposed to be here?" he asked reprovingly. I started to say something about being a member, but he cut me off. "Don't answer back, boy. Just get out, and do it quickly. Arabs aren't allowed here, and you're an Arab!" If I hadn't thought of myself as an Arab before, I now directly grasped the significance of the designation as truly disabling. (Out of Place 44)

Said can neither deny the Englishman's racial identification as a part of his ethnicity, nor can he claim the label entirely, what with his schooling, family life and social strata having always been separate from the Arab-Egyptian population of Cairo. This multitude of external and internal geographies—Cairo, Jerusalem, Dhour, as well as Palestinian, Christian, Arab, American—render Said's simultaneous emplacement within them all a landscape of no-place. 'Home 'is a displaced subjecthood that can be jolted into an awareness of its separate parts through many unexpected ways, both large and small. When Said later departs for the US to attend a picturesque New England prep school, this particular displacement assigns a phantom kind of self-emplacement in relation to Cairo. 'I suffered from the vacancy of Mount Hermon's setting... this gave my American days a sense of impermanence, and even though I spent three quarters of the year in the US, it was always Cairo to which I accorded stability '(Out of Place 135). Yet he himself knows full well that in this 'home 'being projected to, he was none the wiser about whether Arab, Palestinian, American, or Christian was the 'stable 'identity. The geographical dispossession upon coming to the States, however, calls for a reconfiguration of 'home', assigning it a stability from which to calculate distance.

Hoffman's emigration has a similar yet almost inverse effect, in that the feeling of being 'nowhere ' in Vancouver brings with it a realisation of the stasis, the nostalgia seeping into her memories of Krakow. She realises the belated remembering of 'home 'bestows that space one of orientatedness, whereas her multiple position means she can now also 'see it as [her] classmates do—a distant spot, somewhere on the peripheries of the imagination, crowded together with countless other hard-to-remember places with equal insignificance '(Lost in Translation 132). 'Home 'and its dependably static state turns out to be partially imagined, or at least multitudinous, to begin with; the ambiguities of belonging that her family history and Jewish identity call up are now a part of the landscape of the home. The discrepancy between her and her parents 'rootedness in Poland looms in the form of the near-migration to Israel, and it returns at certain moments in Vancouver to ethnogeographically haunt Hoffman with its claims to 'home'. Despite what Marianne Hirsch reads as the unproblematic and 'nostalgically Edenic '(225) tone of the first chapter 'Paradise', the adult Hoffman writes this pre-emigration period by switching back and forth between the 'then 'narrative, seen through a child's love of stability, and her 'now 'narrative, her retrospective reflections, which pick up on the under- currents to those memories. As Casteel points out, in doing so 'Hoffman notes that according to her 'internal geography', Israel is closer to Poland than is Canada. Israel has some

prior associations for her as the 'real home 'of the Jews (291). The adult Hoffman can now also note the ambivalence of this association. She likens it to the partial, shadowy accessibility of political discourse for the child: 'It is another one of those whispered, half-secret subjects, like Jewish- ness, and as with Jewishness, we kids pick up reverberations '(Lost in Translation 57). The unspoken but implied marginality of their heritage is sensed, and this tenuous connection to a home other than Krakow sometimes has a disorienting affect on the stability of the remembered origin. Whether this occurs through the odd piece of news from her childhood friend Marek in Israel, or through her parents 'silence on their Holocaust experiences, or her identification with the figure of the Wandering Jew, it problematises the crystallisation of a nostalgic Krakow towards which she can project her decentredness.

The centre is fast revealing its contingency. A reading such as Hirsch's does not register these nuances to the 'Paradise 'chapter: indeed, as Katarzyna Bartoszynska argues, even the title itself has a self-aware irony, encapsulating the balanced complexity of tone Hoffman uses to treat the past. She is in fact 'acutely aware of the disjunction between felt experience and historical reality... insisting only that the child perceived her world as a paradise, not that it was one, and demonstrating that it was because she was forcibly removed from it that it took on heightened meaning '(5). In a sense, the vast emptiness, blankness and frustrating neutrality she assigns to the Canadian landscape becomes not only a reflection of her first experience of emigration, but of her growing sense of the absences and silences in her previous, 'centred 'life. The Holocaust is an unspoken narrative on the margins of Hoffman's memoir, and only after she assigns Vancouver the representational weight of her displacement does it also call up and take on the weight of her parents 'legacy. Her displacement within Canada becomes the immediate scene of exile, but also a signifier of Holocaust memory. It triggers a realisation that 'home', or her Polish identity, was never entirely an originary and final subjecthood, and this makes Krakow as unstable a ground to refer back to as the 'whispered, half-secret 'Jewishness in her heritage.

Thus the no-place of exile, and the disorienting loss of 'home 'is a two-fold displacement for the émigrés Hoffman and Said; mobility through geographical space and the double vision this engenders dictates inner spatial awareness. Dispossession, paradoxically, is a simultaneous possession of nowhere. The main difference in their spatial experience of displacement is that for Hoffman, it is opaque and formless, whereas for Said, it is multiple and unclear. Yet these can also be read as a shared ground: that of self-emplacement within no-ground. Their new perspectives, projected from these suspended senses of place, reveal the cracks within the image of the home-without-lacks. Nostalgia for the return becomes infused with uncertainty, turning into a commitment to, and a claiming of, the exilic space. 'Tęsknota throws a film over everything around me, and directs my vision inwards. The largest presence within me is the welling up of absence ' (Lost in Translation 115) Hoffman recalls, articulating the kind of self- directed detachment that both she and Said identify with in one way or another throughout their lives. 'I connected this sense of distance, apartness in myself with the need to erect a kind of defence of that other non-"Edward" self', (Out of Place 165) Said writes, referring to the disoriented 'Edward 'of his parents 'making. Said rejoices in the musical, literary self beginning to develop apart from the public 'Edward', imagining a kind of decentred subjectivity that obstinately prefers detachment all the more.

It is a pity, however, that some critical readings of Out of Place take this subject position as Said's final reading of exile, perhaps in order to prove their existing qualms about Said's position as a cosmopolitan intellectual. Aijaz Ahmad's In Theory is one such seminal but somewhat essentialising reading of Said's advocating of detachment. In Ahmad's view, diasporic intellectuals and Third World literary elites (he singles out Salman Rushdie and Said for particular scrutiny) utilise a discourse of displacement that renders exile a condition of the soul: a Euro-American, Modernist aestheticisation. This performs an epistemic violence upon those he argues carry the true burden of the title: those 'people who are prevented, against their own commitment and desire, from

living in the country of their birth by the authority of the state, or by fear of personal annihilation ' (Ahmad 85). Even though Ahmad's overall critique provides a useful reminder of the problems of rhetorical conflation that take no account of class relations or material conditions, in Said's case he does not acknowledge how Out of Place often emphasises that the autobiographer's embracing of displacement was, for him, the best manner of recognising the organising principles of a culture. As Kaplan identifies, 'if distance and displacement operate at the heart of Said's theory of critical practice, then producing relationships across or in spite of distance is just as integral a part of the practice '(116).

This is precisely what the detachment both Said and Hoffman opt for, in all the rawness of their dispossession, later turns into at their own volition. In both Out of Place and *Lost in Translation*, that temporary self-emplacement within an isolated 'nowhere 'is tested, and it makes a lasting impression of its advantages and limits. It turns out to be an inner space of clarity, intellectual insight and poly-vision, yet it also yields no results if it cannot be exercised in the realm of the social. The discovery of this space allows them to realise 'the role of the negative in cultural subject formation means that one's belonging to a nation or community is not simply a given, determined once and for all, but a narration '(Armstrong 104). With this critical perspective, however, the irony of withholding oneself from culture altogether is not lost on either Said or Hoffman. In Said's influential essay 'Reflections on Exile', for instance, he likens disconnected critical faculties to unreality:

> Much of the exile's life is taken up with compensating for disorienting loss by creating a new world to rule [requiring] minimal investment in objects, and places a great premium on mobility and skill. The exile's new world, logically enough, is unnatural and its unreality resembles fiction. (181)

Hoffman, too, often opens up this discourse to give momentum to her inner cultural shifts, and to step away from the stasis of self-isolation: 'I know that I cannot sustain my sense of a separate reality forever, for after all, the only reality is a shared reality, situated within a common ground ' (Lost in Translation 195). Even exile must be spatialised, and this newfound ground, inhabited. It can, however, be a terrain accommodating of mobility and poly-belonging.

After this need for some kind of orientation to external spaces is established, the question of what kind remains—this is where the event of 'double- emigration 'in both autobiographies merits close attention. It is difficult to pinpoint or assign this 'second arrival 'to a specific emigration or geographical place for either Said or Hoffman. Simplistically, Hoffman's sense of displacement is better negotiated after she emigrates once more, this time to the US for university and the making of her adult life. 'In a splintered society, what does one assimilate to? Perhaps the very splintering itself', (Lost in Translation 197) Hoffman proposes, calling for a commitment to assimilation and a commitment to the liberation of interpretative multiplicity, having interiorised both through displacement. Identity work is one of collage, and the memoir in a way charts the gradual reconciliation of these ideas of emplacement as they coexist with, and enrich, selective and productive displacements. They need to work towards connecting her mobile sense of self to her world, with enough lightness of touch so as to retain the multitudinous perspectives available to her: 'Eventually, the voices enter me; by assuming them, I gradually make them mine. I am being remade, fragment by fragment, like a patchwork quilt '(Lost in Translation 120). 'Making voices hers 'are acts of listening, speaking, reading and finally, writing, where she locates the formation of a new, manifold subjecthood.

Said, too, experiences another arrival that his 'first 'emigration to the US, and Mount Hermon prep school, did not bring about. This happens the summer before he is due to start at Princeton: 'I experienced the Egyptian part of my life in an unreflecting, almost sham, way during the summer,

slipping into it the moment I arrived in Cairo, whereas my American life was acquiring a more durable, independent reality '(Out of Place 246). It is a marked change from the Said two years prior, approaching an Egyptian teacher at Mount Hermon in search for 'some friendly contact emanating from home '(Out of Place 228). The second arrival gains a more pleasurable shade due to the increased agency, and self- directed results, that Said and Hoffman associate with it. Casteel, for instance, assigns great emphasis to these moments in support of her argument against binary Old World/New World readings of exile narratives. Indeed, the second destination does take on separate aspects of displacement than the first, possibly due to the cathartic effect of turning that initial arrival from nowhere to a now- designated somewhere. However, neither of these moments for Hoffman or Said assuage dispossession in themselves; rather, the spaces they are now in offer certain tools of selecting and articulating a self-emplacement. It is no more and no less than as Hoffman says: 'this is not a place where I happen to be, this happens to be the place where I am; this is the only place '(Lost in Translation 171). The significance of 'this 'lies not in where it is located, but by what means can one speak from here. Their second arrivals harness that 'outsider ' perspective that enables the critical voice, which can then find an outlet in writing. It is in this sense that *Lost in Translation* and *Out of Place* contain a second arrival: they choose to use language to take into their own hands where, and towards what, they wish to orient themselves.

Channelling their multiple positions towards analysis and affiliation, Hoffman draws both freedom and a sense of emplacement from language, and Said's preferred cosmopolitanism provides the secular ground for his later critical work within the history and politics of his ethnic 'origins', Palestine. In *Lost in Translation*, Hoffman's jolt of identification with English comes years after mastering the language, marking this moment of 'second arrival 'into the space of multiple recognition. While teaching Eliot's The Love Song of J. Alfred Prufrock, she writes:

> I crack the last barrier between myself and the language—the barrier I sensed but couldn't get through...this is it, the extra, the attribute of language over and above function and criticism. Words become, as they were in childhood, beautiful things—except this is better, because they're now crosshatched with a complexity of meaning. (Lost 186)

It is no coincidence that at this moment Hoffman chooses to remind us of the perceptions of her childhood self. With the longed-for organicism of her self- emplacement in the 'Paradise 'chapter still fresh in our minds, her realisation of the stasis of nostalgia, the freedom of displacement, and then the necessity of retaining connections all culminate into a moment that comes closest to effortless identification. One language, one home is a beautiful thing, Hoffman muses—but she has now crucially come to be able to articulate, this is better.

Said's memoir has more to say on the course of his self-emplacement than its last few lines, which throw the reader off-balance in their melancholy but celebratory turn towards decentredness. As Roger J. Porter points out in a nuanced reading, there emerges a clear purpose, and points of orientation for his advocacy of displacement, points which Said himself does not always explicitly connect: 'Said joins the un-suppression of his private history with the un- suppression of Palestine's unspoken history. Said's examination of his own origins and the denied public history counters the enforced repressions of his early years '(Porter 311). Indeed, Said channels his propensity for critical distance into an altered kind of 'return 'to the region of his home(s). Through the growing political awareness Said is able to cultivate once away from home—or particularly, away from the sphere of his father's pragmatically depoliticised discourse—he feels that 'coming from a part of the world that seemed to be in a state of chaotic transformation became the symbol of what was out of place about me '(Out of Place 248). Later, again: 'while at Princeton I first approached the political currents and issues not only of the period but which in one way or another were to influence my outlook intellectually and politically for the rest of my life '(280). Displacement becomes a means of moving past the self, at will. The secular and self-empowering position of the displaced opens a

space to speak from, in both analysis and affiliation, thus marking what is perhaps closest to a 'second arrival 'for Said. This is curiously similar to Hoffman's realisation in the Prufrock episode that the joys of self-emplacement within a language are amplified by the knowledge that she was once distanced from it, and can still be so, at will. Although Said's memoir yokes personal reflection and international politics together earlier on in the narrative, these seem largely due to the high- profile company his family keeps, and provoke little reflection like conscious affiliations Said makes later, from a position of empowered self-emplacement. Though Hosam Abaoul-Ela argues *Out of Place* unequivocally sustains a connection between the interpersonal events of Said's life and global politics, it is a far stretch to suggest 'Said relates personal events as reflective of or constituted in world politics '(24). What Aboul-Ela is picking up on though, however inter- preted, is how the memoir carries traces of Said's (re)affiliation with the places from which he chooses to speak. He writes:

> 1967 brought more dislocations, whereas for me it seemed to embody the dislocation that subsumed all the other losses, the disappeared worlds of my youth and upbringing, the unpolitical years of my education...the shock of that war drove me back to where it had all started, the struggle over Palestine. I subsequently entered the newly transformed Middle Eastern landscape as a part of the Palestinian movement...this was an experience that drew on the agitated, largely hidden side of my prior life—the anti-authoritarianism, the need to break through an imposed and enforced silence... (Out of Place 293)

He himself makes the connections between what he identifies as character traits fostered by his sense of displacement—the need for room to manoeuvre, intellectually and ideologically—and the context within which he has (crucially) chosen to exercise these traits. Utilising his situatedness on the boundary between home and away to articulate a critical perspective can be a significant act of voluntary emplacement. From this position, Said defines culture as 'an environment, process, and hegemony in which individuals and their works are embedded, as well as overseen at the top by a superstructure and at the base by a whole series of methodological attitudes '(The World 8). Such a notion of culture, in turn, undermines naturalisations and essentialisations within concepts of belonging or identity. Turning his displacement to the work of recognising these organising structures within culture is a position of insight, rather than mere distance, for the cultural critic.

At this point a previously introduced issue could rear its head: that voluntary self-emplacement has garnered a degree of criticism due to its propensity to be read as narrowing 'exile 'to an emblematic metaphor for the displaced intellectual. Kaplan notes that 'the cosmopolitan intellectual as migrant figure signals for many either the liberatory or negative effects of an increasingly transnational world '(123), the latter effects of which critics like Ahmad, Benedict Anderson and Tim Brennan caution against. Said, for Brennan, is among those writers and critics constructing 'authentic public voices of the Third World 'even when they have similar 'tastes, training, current habitation '(6) as their Western counterparts. He is correct in the sense that Said's social and economic class affiliations do not lie with that of dispossessed Palestinians today, but geographically and politically, Said can make a claim to dispossession. What those like Ahmad and Brennan are cautioning against is for the émigré intellectual in the West using mere ethnicity as an affiliative point from which to speak authoritatively or make generalisations on national belonging.

That their privileged positions enable critical distance cannot erase the inescapable reality of 'place ' for many. *Out of Place* acknowledges and connects his displacement to the privileges of travel and education. At no point does Said imply the multiply-positioned critic can emerge through sheer will from all environments, regardless of economic or cultural limitations. Having been born into a 'displaced 'sense of home and having engaged in political as well as critical work for Palestine, Said nevertheless does not propose he can speak on behalf of Palestinian nationalist struggles all the more for his displaced status, but rather secularly pose their right to self-spokesmanship from the

cosmopolitan position his distance has fostered. To designate as cosmopolitan, in this sense, 'is not to claim that the nation is no longer a viable category of lived experience 'or to refer to an ideal of detachment, but to 'a reality of (re)attachment, multiple attachment, or attachment at a distance ' (Stanton 2). *Out of Place* seems to veer to the former when Said announces, at the end, that he prefers 'being not quite right and out of place '(Out 295), but such a view implies the very necessity of attachments: being out of place, after all, is a spatially-interdependent place to be. 'Coming at the end of his memoir', Danuta Fjellestad perceptively notes, 'this declaration seems to endorse a dislocated mode of "residence on earth"... but paradoxically, cosmopolitanism seems to grow out of dislocation from home '(209). One cannot be upheld without a continuing, and constantly self-revising, relation to the other. Indeed, in order to 'theorise both distance and the constructive, critical bridging of distance, Said distinguishes between filiation and affiliation '(Kaplan 116). This is a nuance of his active self-emplacement, and can be used to read Hoffman as well.

Affiliation is nonbiological, nonessentialist, and Said acknowledges both its compensatory and critical capabilities in contrast to filiation. Affiliation compensates for the lack of the perspective borne of filiation, but it is also generative of new systems. This latter function requires one 'to recognise the difference between instinctual filiation and social affiliation, and to show how affiliation sometimes reproduces filiation, sometimes makes its own forms. Immediately, then, most of the political and social world becomes available for critical and secular scrutiny '(The World 24). This connectedness is only possible due to the availability and cultivation of a dispossessive, alternative perspective that has the agency to produce affiliations of a similarly multiple nature. 'Exile is predicated on the existence of, love for, and bond with, one's native place '(Reflections, 185), Said offers in a reflection of this relationship. Such interdependence recalls Hoffman's heightened appreciation for linguistic self-posses- sion, precisely because that alternative language has consciously, painstakingly been transformed from Other to one's own. Sociologist Helma Lutz draws attention to how Hoffman importantly 'frames this as a continuing experience', even referring to Homi K. Bhabha's 'Third Space 'to re-emphasise that migrant identity construction must be understood in terms of its spatial (non)positioning (349). The space of their mutual dependence—home and exile, native tongue and acquired language—is the margin where self-emplacement occurs, and that critically productive detachment can and should be projected outwards into the world of affiliations. 'In English, I wind my way back to my old, Polish melancholy. When I meet it, I reenter myself, fold myself again in my own skin. I'm cured of the space sickness of transcendence '(Lost in Translation 274). This is the (written) space where Hoffman's and Said's exiles are indeed translated, and thus transcended, from displacement towards a space where multiple emplacements can be negotiated.

In *Lost in Translation* and *Out of Place*, the act of writing autobiography is not only one of inscribing or exercising subjectivities, but becomes one of self- emplacement. It becomes a stable element that indiscriminately provides a scene for the construction of their multiple positions of subjecthood, while acknowledging that these positions themselves are open to evolving with each displacement. The dual lens of this Third Space provides the agency to detach or attach one's vision within the hybrid moulds available. Is this 'a split between text and experience', marred by 'tensions between an intellectual understand- ing of one's condition and the experience of loss '(Fjellestad 142)? Hoffman's autobiography may indeed at times seem on the cusp of a postmodern identification with self as text. The narrative of *Out of Place* is more driven by a recounting of personal and global events, where Said interjects quite gently and unobtrusively with the rare internal contemplation. Even as his identity negotiation begins to grow out of displacement, he tends to allow the memories of events, people and conversations to do their work in shaping the Said of the text for our scrutiny. Hoffman, however, examines her internal landscape as she writes, subordinating the chronology of actual events to the spatial gymnastics of recall. There is a greater sense of the role such memory/text-acts play within her continuing process of self-orientation. In the context of displacement, however, neither one nor the other approach differentiates between the

centrality of space in the identity constitution of the exilic self. Hoffman's and Said's attention to dwelling extends place beyond geographically determined definitions. Emplacedness, at first fully yoked to 'home', haunts their many displacements until the multitude of their points of cultural and linguistic reference release their alternative, empowering meanings. In configuring the different 'belongings 'their selves undertake, the displacements and arrivals in *Lost in Translation* and *Out of Place* advocate a space of autobiography where plural identity is recognised as ontologically cohesive. For the writing of this plurality demands the exilic selves to 'arrive 'together, so as to be read.

References

Aboul-Ela, Hosam. 'Edward Said's "Out of Place": Criticism, Polemic, and Arab American Identity. 'MELUS 31 (2006): 15–32.

Ahmad, Aijaz. In Theory: Classes, Nations, Literatures. London: Verso, 1992.

Armstrong, Paul B. 'Being "Out of Place": Edward W. Said and the Contradictions of Cultural Differences. 'Modern Language Quarterly 64 (2003): 97–121.

Bartoszynska, Katarzyna. 'The Self in Nonfiction: Eva Hoffman's autobiographical project. 'Life Writing 2 (2005): 3–17.

Bhabha, Homi K. The Location of Culture. London: Routledge, 1994.

Brennan, Tim. 'Cosmopolitans and Celebrities. 'Race and Class 31 (1989): 1–20.

Casteel, Sarah Phillips. 'Eva Hoffman's Double Emigration: Canada as the Site of Exile in Lost in Translation. 'Biography 24 (2001): 288–301.

Fjellestad, Danuta. 'Writing Affiliation And Dislocation In The Memoirs Of Ihab Hassan And Edward Said. 'Prose Studies 31 (2009): 202–13.

George, Rosemary Marangoly. The Politics of Home: Post-colonial Relocations and Twentieth-Century Fiction. Cambridge: Cambridge UP, 1996.

Hirsch, Marianne. Family Frames. Cambridge: Harvard UP, 1997.

Hoffman, Eva. Lost in Translation: A Life in A New Language. London: Vintage, 1998.

Kaplan, Caren. Questions of Travel: Postmodern Discourses of Displacement. London: Duke UP, 1996.

Lutz, Helma. 'Lost in translation? The role of language in migrants 'biographies: What can micro-sociologists learn from Eva Hoffman? 'European Journal of Women's Studies 18 (2011): 347–60.

Porter, Roger J. 'Autobiography, Exile, Home: The Egyptian Memoirs of Gini Alhadeff, André Aciman, and Edward Said. 'Biography 24 (2001): 302–13.

Said, Edward W. Out of Place: A Memoir. London: Granta, 1999.

Said, Edward W. Reflections on Exile: and Other Literary and Cultural Essays. London: Granta, 2001.

Said, Edward W. The World, the Text, and the Critic. London: Vintage, 1991.

Stanton, Katherine. Cosmopolitan Fictions: Ethics, Politics, and Global Change in the Works of Kazuo Ishiguro, Michael Ondaatje, Jamaica Kincaid, and J. M. Coetzee. London: Routledge, 2006.